

No. SC21-175  
LT No. 5D19-2549; 481997CA004541A001OX

---

---

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF FLORIDA**

---

BRINDA COATES,  
*Petitioner,*

*v.*

R.J. REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY,  
*Respondent.*

---

ON DISCRETIONARY REVIEW FROM THE  
FIFTH DISTRICT COURT OF APPEAL OF FLORIDA

---

**APPENDIX TO AMICUS CURIAE BRIEF OF  
PHILIP MORRIS USA INC. IN SUPPORT OF  
APPELLEE R.J. REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY**

---

Geoffrey J. Michael  
Florida Bar No. 86152  
John P. Elwood  
Admitted *pro hac vice*  
Samuel F. Callahan  
Admitted *pro hac vice*  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
601 Massachusetts Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20001-3743  
Phone: 202-942-5000  
Fax: 202-942-5999  
geoffrey.michael@arnoldporter.com

January 10, 2022

*Counsel for Philip Morris USA Inc.*

RECEIVED, 01/10/2022 01:03:20 PM, Clerk, Supreme Court

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Carter, Grady*	Individual	1996	Duval Co.	1995-934	\$750,000	Not requested	No reduction
Widdick, Angela	Individual	1998	Duval Co.	1997-3522	\$552,249	\$450,000	No reduction
Engle, et al., Howard	Class action	2000	Miami-Dade Co.	1994-8273	\$12,704,000	\$144,871,473,549	No reduction
Jones, Robert	Individual	2000	Hillsborough Co.	1997-4966	\$200,028	Defense	Final judgment not entered
Kenyon, Floyd	Individual	2001	Hillsborough Co.	2000-5401	\$165,000	Defense	No reduction
French, Lynn	Broin Progeny	2002	Miami-Dade Co.	2000-1706	\$5,500,000	Not permitted	Compensatory reduced to \$500,000
Lukacs, John	Individual	2002	Miami-Dade Co.	2001-3822	\$37,500,000	Not requested	Compensatory reduced to \$24,835,000
Eastman, John	Individual	2003	Pinellas Co.	1997-5968	\$6,538,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$3,269,000

---

\* As noted in the accompanying *amicus* brief, this survey includes all Florida tobacco cases where a jury has entered a verdict against a defendant manufacturer, even if currently on appeal. The reported values for actual and punitive damages are the values as awarded by the jury, not accounting for any reduction or reversal of damages awards on appeal.

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Arnitz, Ronald	Individual	2004	Hillsborough Co.	2000-2408	\$600,000	Not permitted	Compensatory reduced to \$240,000
Davis, Beverly	Individual	2004	Broward Co.	2002-18944	\$545,000	Not permitted	No reduction
Ferlanti, Carmela	Individual	2009	Broward Co.	2003-21697	\$1,295,972	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$815,972
Hess, Elaine	Engle Progeny	2009	Broward Co.	2007-11513	\$3,000,000	\$5,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$1,260,000
Sherman, Melba	Engle Progeny	2009	Broward Co.	2007-23438	\$1,550,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$775,000
Martin, Mathilde	Engle Progeny	2009	Escambia Co.	2007-2520	\$5,000,000	\$25,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,300,000
Naugle, Lucinda	Engle Progeny	2009	Broward Co.	2007-36736	\$56,590,000	\$244,000,000	Reduced to a total of \$38,947,500
Barbanell, Leon	Engle Progeny	2009	Broward Co.	2007-36737	\$5,339,198	Directed verdict	Compensatory reduced to \$1,948,807
Brown, Jimmie	Engle Progeny	2009	Broward Co.	2007-4646	\$1,200,000	Not requested	Compensatory reduced to \$600,000
Campbell, Franklin	Engle Progeny	2009	Escambia Co.	2008-2147	\$7,800,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$3,354,000
Cohen, Robin	Engle Progeny	2010	Broward Co.	2007-11515	\$10,000,000	\$20,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$6,666,667

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Tate, Ellen	Engle Progeny	2010	Broward Co.	2007-21723	\$8,000,000	\$16,250,000	Compensatory reduced to \$5,120,000
Gray, Carolyn	Engle Progeny	2010	Escambia Co.	2007-2773	\$7,000,000	\$2,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$4,200,000
Clay, Finna	Engle Progeny	2010	Escambia Co.	2007-3020	\$3,496,943	\$18,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$2,447,860
Putney, Sharon	Engle Progeny	2010	Broward Co.	2007-36668	\$15,086,689	\$5,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$500,000 following appeal
Hall, Amanda	Engle Progeny	2010	Alachua Co.	2007-5098	\$5,000,000	\$12,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,250,000
Buonomo, Connie	Engle Progeny	2010	Broward Co.	2008-19612	\$5,235,000	\$25,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$4,057,125
Grossman, Jan	Engle Progeny	2010	Broward Co.	2008-25828	\$1,934,727	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$483,682
Townsend, Lyantie	Engle Progeny	2010	Alachua Co.	2008-3978	\$10,800,000	\$80,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$5,508,000; punitive remitted to \$20,000,000
Alexander, Earline	Engle Progeny	2010	Alachua Co.	2008-5067	\$2,500,000	\$2,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$1,275,000
Douglas, James	Engle Progeny	2010	Hillsborough Co.	2008-8108	\$5,000,000	Not requested	Compensatory reduced to \$2,500,000

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Webb, Diane	Engle Progeny	2010	Levy Co.	2009-1285	\$8,000,000	\$72,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,600,000; punitive reduced to \$25,000,000
Piendle, Margaret	Engle Progeny	2010	Palm Beach Co.	50:2008-38777	\$4,000,000	\$270,000	Compensatory reduced to \$2,200,000
Bowman, Patricia	Engle Progeny	2011	Duval Co.	16-2007-11175	\$1,500,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$450,000
Sury, Robert	Engle Progeny	2011	Duval Co.	16-2007-11175	\$1,000,000	Defense	No reduction
Mrozek, Michelle	Engle Progeny	2011	Duval Co.	16-2007-11952	\$6,000,000	\$11,300,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,900,588
Jewett, Thomas	Engle Progeny	2011	Duval Co.	16-2007-12087-IXXX-MA	\$1,092,981	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$327,894
Allen, Andy	Engle Progeny	2011	Duval Co.	16-2007-8311	\$6,000,000	\$34,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,600,000
Ciccione, Pamela	Engle Progeny	2011	Broward Co.	2004-13258	\$3,196,222	\$50,000	Compensatory reduced to \$958,867
Sulcer, Betty	Engle Progeny	2011	Escambia Co.	2007-2540	\$225,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$11,250

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Reese, Julie	Engle Progeny	2011	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-30296	\$3,551,277	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$1,065,383
Koballa, Stella	Engle Progeny	2011	Volusia Co.	2007-33334	\$1,000,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$300,000
Hatziyannakis, Desp.	Engle Progeny	2011	Broward Co.	2007-36751	\$269,609	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$86,275
Soffer, Lucille	Engle Progeny	2011	Alachua Co.	2007-5192	\$5,000,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$2,000,000
Mack, Peter	Engle Progeny	2011	Alachua Co.	2008-3256	\$1,000,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$510,000
Huish, Anna	Engle Progeny	2011	Alachua Co.	2008-3714	\$750,000	\$3,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$374,000
Kirkland, Leroy	Engle Progeny	2011	Hillsborough Co.	2008-673	\$100,000	\$250,000	Compensatory reduced to \$10,000
Tullo, Mary	Engle Progeny	2011	Palm Beach Co.	50:2008-35457	\$4,500,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$2,475,000
Sikes, Janice	Engle Progeny	2012	Duval Co.	16-2007-11654-KXXX-MA	\$4,084,517	\$2,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,523,329
Hiott, Carolyn	Engle Progeny	2012	Duval Co.	16-2008-391	\$1,825,000	\$0	Compensatory reduced to \$730,000

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Lock, Richard	Engle Progeny	2012	Pinellas Co.	2007-12520	\$1,150,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$207,000
Ballard, Ralph	Engle Progeny	2012	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-30336	\$8,550,000	Not requested	Compensatory reduced to \$5,000,000
Buchanan, Nan	Engle Progeny	2012	Leon Co.	2007-3565	\$5,500,000	Defense	No reduction
Alexander, Dorothy	Engle Progeny	2012	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-46830	\$20,000,000	\$25,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$8,000,000
Ward, Erskin	Engle Progeny	2012	Escambia Co.	2008-2135	\$1,000,000	\$1,700,000	Compensatory reduced to \$487,000
Calloway, Marvine	Engle Progeny	2012	Broward Co.	2008-21770	\$20,500,000	\$54,850,000	Compensatory reduced to \$16,100,000
Mack, Peter	Engle Progeny	2012	Alachua Co.	2008-3256	\$2,900,000	Not permitted	Compensatory reduced to \$1,885,000
Smith, Emmon	Engle Progeny	2012	Jackson Co.	2009-719	\$10,000,000	\$20,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$7,000,000
Schlenther, Harry	Engle Progeny	2012	Pinellas Co.	2010-5736	\$5,000,000	\$2,500,000	Compensatory increased to \$5,029,705 following additur
Hallgren, Theodore	Engle Progeny	2012	Highlands Co.	2010-761	\$2,009,472	\$1,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$1,004,736

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Williams, Virginia	Engle Progeny	2012	Miami-Dade Co.	2011-26313	\$5,000,000	Not permitted	Compensatory reduced to \$4,250,000
Smith, James	Engle Progeny	2012	Middle District	3:09-10048	\$600,000	\$20,000	No reduction
Duke, George	Engle Progeny	2012	Middle District	3:09-10104	\$30,705	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$7,676
Walker, Alvin	Engle Progeny	2012	Middle District	3:09-10598	\$275,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$27,500
Odum, Sharon	Engle Progeny	2013	Duval Co.	16-2007-11175	\$200,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$100,000
Starr Blundell, Teresa	Engle Progeny	2013	Duval Co.	16-2007-12167	\$500,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$100,000
Ruffo, Dorothy	Engle Progeny	2013	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-30292	\$1,500,000	Not requested	Compensatory reduced to \$225,000
Marotta 1, Phil	Engle Progeny	2013	Broward Co.	2007-36723	\$6,000,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$3,480,000; limited punitive damages retrial ordered
Naugle, Lucinda	Engle Progeny	2013	Broward Co.	2007-36736	\$4,146,390	\$7,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,731,751
Schoeff, Joan	Engle Progeny	2013	Broward Co.	2008-22608	\$10,500,000	\$30,000,000	No reduction
Grossman, Jan	Engle Progeny	2013	Broward Co.	2008-25828	\$15,351,741	\$22,500,000	No reduction



<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Rizzuto, John	Engle Progeny	2013	Hernando Co.	2008-3318	\$12,550,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$6,122,785
Evers, Cindy	Engle Progeny	2013	Hillsborough Co.	2008-9154	\$3,230,000	\$12,360,042	Compensatory reduced to \$2,950,000
Crawford, William	Engle Progeny	2013	Miami-Dade Co.	2011-14352	\$9,000,000	\$1,000,000	No reduction
Thibault, Robert	Engle Progeny	2013	Escambia Co.	2011-543	\$1,750,000	\$1,275,000	No reduction
Aycock, Thelma	Engle Progeny	2013	Middle District	3:09-10928	\$5,900,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$4,277,500
Giddens, Roger	Engle Progeny	2013	Middle District	3:09-13590	\$80,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$5,600
Graham, Earl	Engle Progeny	2013	Middle District	3:09-13602	\$2,700,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$825,000
Searcy, Cheryl	Engle Progeny	2013	Middle District	3:09-13723	\$6,000,000	\$20,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$1,000,000; punitive reduced to \$3,340,000
Gafney, Kathleen	Engle Progeny	2013	Palm Beach Co.	50:2007-20540	\$5,800,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$3,828,000
Cohen, David	Engle Progeny	2013	Palm Beach Co.	50:2009-4042	\$2,055,050	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$1,233,030
Skolnick, Beatrice	Engle Progeny	2013	Palm Beach Co.	50:2009-4045	\$2,555,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$1,433,000

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Clayton, Gloria	Engle Progeny	2014	Duval Co.	16-2007-11175	\$600,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$60,000
Taylor, Helen	Engle Progeny	2014	Duval Co.	16-2007-11654	\$4,478,655	\$521,345	Compensatory reduced to \$4,116,000
Allen, Andy	Engle Progeny	2014	Duval Co.	16-2007-8311	\$3,094,000	\$15,510,831	No reduction
Bowden, Gloria	Engle Progeny	2014	Duval Co.	16-2008-391	\$5,000,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$3,000,000
Lourie, James	Engle Progeny	2014	Hillsborough Co.	2007-18137	\$1,371,549	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$507,472
Cheeley, Willie	Engle Progeny	2014	Broward Co.	2008-22583	\$3,000,000	\$2,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$1,500,000
Sammarco, John	Engle Progeny	2014	Broward Co.	2008-22603	\$2,500,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$1,125,000
Irimi, Heather	Engle Progeny	2014	Broward Co.	2008-26337	\$3,123,437	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$937,030
Goveia, John	Engle Progeny	2014	Orange Co.	2008-760	\$850,000	\$4,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$595,000
Robinson, Cynthia	Engle Progeny	2014	Escambia Co.	2008-98	\$16,893,833	\$23,623,718,907	Punitive reduced to \$16,893,833
Webb, Dianne	Engle Progeny	2014	Levy Co.	2009-1285	\$900,000	\$450,000	Compensatory reduced to \$810,000

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Wilcox, Robert	Engle Progeny	2014	Miami-Dade Co.	2010-45462	\$7,000,000	\$8,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$4,900,000
CuCulino, Antonio	Engle Progeny	2014	Miami-Dade Co.	2010-62733	\$12,500,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$5,000,000 as to PM USA (defense verdict for RJR)
Boatright, Richard	Engle Progeny	2014	Polk Co.	2011-158	\$15,000,000	\$20,000,000	No reduction
Hubbird, Sherri	Engle Progeny	2014	Miami-Dade Co.	2012-18904	\$3,000,000	\$25,000,000	No reduction
Lambert, Cydne	Engle Progeny	2014	Pinellas Co.	2013-6209	\$3,600,000	\$9,500,000	No reduction
Schleider, Diane	Engle Progeny	2014	Miami-Dade Co.	2013-6984	\$21,000,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$14,700,000
Burkhart, Pauline	Engle Progeny	2014	Middle District	3:09-10727	\$5,000,000	\$2,500,000	No reduction
Griffin, Patrick	Engle Progeny	2014	Middle District	3:09-11128	\$1,268,402	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$634,201
Harris, Patricia	Engle Progeny	2014	Middle District	3:09-13482	\$1,726,650	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$650,650
Harford, William	Engle Progeny	2014	Middle District	3:09-13631	\$330,000	Defense	Final judgment not entered
Kerrivan, Kenneth	Engle Progeny	2014	Middle District	3:09-13703	\$15,800,000	\$25,300,000	No reduction
Berger, Judith	Engle Progeny	2014	Middle District	3:09-14157	\$6,250,000	\$20,760,000	No reduction

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Perrotto, Debra	Engle Progeny	2014	Palm Beach Co.	50:2007-23841	\$4,087,339	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$2,084,543; limited punitive damages retrial ordered
Bakst, Michael	Engle Progeny	2014	Palm Beach Co.	50:2008-38863	\$6,004,209	\$14,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$4,504,029
Brown, Mary	Engle Progeny	2015	Duval Co.	16-2007-11175	\$6,375,277	Defense	No reduction
Jordan, Elaine	Engle Progeny	2015	Duval Co.	16-2013-8903	\$7,795,000	\$3,205,000	Compensatory reduced to \$6,431,080
Larkin, Paul	Individual	2015	Miami-Dade Co.	2002-2829	\$4,955,000	\$8,500,000	No reduction
Danielson, Micah	Engle Progeny	2015	Escambia Co.	2007-2737	\$325,000	\$325,000	Compensatory damages struck; limited second trial ordered
O'Hara, Colette	Engle Progeny	2015	Escambia Co.	2007-3065	\$14,697,465	\$20,000,000	No reduction
Ledoux, Roland	Engle Progeny	2015	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-43991	\$10,000,000	\$25,000,000	No reduction
Gore, Robert	Engle Progeny	2015	Indian River Co.	2008-10052	\$2,000,000	Defense	No reduction
Merino, Carmenza	Engle Progeny	2015	Miami-Dade Co.	2008-1287	\$8,000,000	\$6,500,000	No reduction

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Block, Sharon	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2008-19469	\$1,028,000	\$800,000	Compensatory reduced to \$462,975
Ryan, Thomas	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2008-22579	\$21,500,000	\$25,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$14,000,000
McCoy, John	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2008-25806	\$1,500,000	\$9,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$975,000
Cooper, Mary	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2008-26350	\$4,500,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$1,504,522
Tognoli, Stephen	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2008-45898	\$1,050,000	Not requested	No reduction
Lewis, James	Engle Progeny	2015	Volusia Co.	2009-30058	\$750,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$187,500
McKeever, Vickie	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2010-37561	\$5,798,170	\$11,625,000	No reduction
Hardin, Joyce	Engle Progeny	2015	Miami-Dade Co.	2012-29000	\$776,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced \$100,880
Duignan, Kevin	Engle Progeny	2015	Pinellas Co.	2013-10978	\$6,000,000	\$6,000,000	No reduction
Monroe, Florence	Engle Progeny	2015	Gadsden Co.	2013-1121	\$11,000,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$6,380,000
Gordon, John	Engle Progeny	2015	Charlotte Co.	2013-1552	\$5,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$100

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Marchese, Gertrude	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2013-2849	\$1,000,000	\$500,000	No reduction
Pollari, Rose	Engle Progeny	2015	Broward Co.	2014-1563	\$10,000,000	\$3,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$8,500,000
Barbose, Phyllis	Engle Progeny	2015	Pasco Co.	2014-3532	\$10,000,000	\$1,000,000	No reduction
Brown, Donna	Engle Progeny	2015	Middle District	3:09-10687	\$8,287,448	\$9,000,000	No reduction
Sowers, Mary	Engle Progeny	2015	Middle District	3:09-11829	\$4,250,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$2,125,000
Zamboni, Merle	Engle Progeny	2015	Middle District	3:09-11957	\$340,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$136,000
Gray, Ellen	Engle Progeny	2015	Middle District	3:09-13603	\$6,000,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$3,000,000
Landau, Seymour	Engle Progeny	2015	Middle District	3:09-13728	\$100,000	[\$700,000]	Following the compensatory verdict, the case was included in Middle District settlement
Prentice, Linda	Engle Progeny	2016	Duval Co.	16-2007-11511	\$6,400,000	\$0	No reduction
Sermons, Michael	Engle Progeny	2016	Duval Co.	16-2008-397	\$65,000	\$68,300	No reduction

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
McCabe, James	Engle Progeny	2016	Hillsborough Co.	2007-17632	\$5,000,000	\$6,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$1,500,000
Howles, Mary	Engle Progeny	2016	Broward Co.	2007-34919	\$4,000,000	\$6,000,000	No reduction
Martin, Stanley	Engle Progeny	2016	Broward Co.	2007-36440	\$5,411,120	\$650,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,679,562; punitive damages struck on appeal
McCall, Bernice	Engle Progeny	2016	Broward Co.	2007-36888	\$350,000	Not reached	No reduction
Mathis, Hazel	Engle Progeny	2016	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-47118	\$5,000,000	Defense	No reduction
Nally, Marlene	Engle Progeny	2016	Polk Co.	2007-7627	\$6,000,000	\$12,000,000	No reduction
Ledo, Mirtha	Engle Progeny	2016	Miami-Dade Co.	2008-113	\$6,000,000	Directed verdict	Compensatory reduced to \$2,940,000
Turner, Vivian	Engle Progeny	2016	Broward Co.	2008-19616	\$3,000,000	\$10,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$2,400,000
Konzelman, Alan	Engle Progeny	2016	Broward Co.	2008-19620	\$8,795,000	\$20,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$7,475,750
Oshinsky-Blacker, Marilyn	Engle Progeny	2016	Broward Co.	2008-25841	\$6,154,998	\$3,000,000	No reduction
Varner, Joseph	Engle Progeny	2016	Broward Co.	2008-26345	\$1,500,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$375,000

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Ewing, Doris	Engle Progeny	2016	Escambia Co.	2009-2791	\$240,000	Not reached	Compensatory reduced to \$4,800
Dion, George	Engle Progeny	2016	Sarasota Co.	2013-5673	\$12,000,000	\$30,000	No reduction
Pardue, Mary	Engle Progeny	2016	Alachua Co.	2014-2010	\$5,885,000	\$13,500,000	Compensatory reduced \$5,200,602
Johnston, Barbara	Engle Progeny	2016	Sarasota Co.	2014-4023	\$7,500,000	\$14,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$6,750,000
Ahrens, Ina	Engle Progeny	2016	Pinellas Co.	2014-5826	\$9,000,000	\$5,000,000	No reduction
Smith, Sherry	Engle Progeny	2016	Volusia Co.	2015-30548	\$3,000,000	Defense	No reduction
Enochs, Linda	Engle Progeny	2016	Palm Beach Co.	50:2007-24173	\$21,000,000	\$12,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$16,380,000
Ford, Minnie	Engle Progeny	2016	Palm Beach Co.	50:2016-2230	\$1,022,840	Defense	No reduction
Douglas, Robert	Engle Progeny	2017	Duval Co.	16-2008-386	\$131,317	Defense	Final judgment not entered
Quackenbush, Kathleen	Individual	2017	Volusia Co.	2007-12188	\$358,152	\$930,000	Compensatory reduced to \$71,630
Maloney, John	Engle Progeny	2017	Lee Co.	2007-15578	\$1,650,000	Defense	No reduction
Martin, Linda	Engle Progeny	2017	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-34267	\$1,100,000	\$1,300,000	Compensatory reduced to \$605,000
Thomas, Bertie	Engle Progeny	2017	Broward Co.	2007-36432	\$4,000,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$2,200,000



<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Sommers, Steffany	Engle Progeny	2017	Miami-Dade Co.	2008-1464	\$1,000,000	Not permitted	No reduction (limited punitive damages retrial ordered)
Santoro, Charles	Engle Progeny	2017	Broward Co.	2008-25807	\$1,605,000	\$205,000	No reduction
Fox, Blanche	Engle Progeny	2017	Broward Co.	2008-26348	\$6,000,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$3,000,000
Lawrence, Joy	Engle Progeny	2017	Marion Co.	2009-178	\$858,209	Agreement	Compensatory reduced to \$300,373
Sheffield, Mary	Engle Progeny	2017	Orange Co.	2013-9469	\$1,800,000	\$5,000,000	No reduction
Wallace, Fontaine	Engle Progeny	2017	Brevard Co.	2014-52862	\$12,000,000	\$24,000,000	No reduction
Bryant, Veda	Engle Progeny	2017	Escambia Co.	2015-1691	\$581,000	\$225,000	The defendants paid a total of \$681,000
Whitmire, James	Engle Progeny	2017	Leon Co.	2015-2337	\$3,000,000	Mistrial	No reduction
Brown, John	Engle Progeny	2017	Pinellas Co.	2015-24510	\$5,400,000	\$400,000	No reduction
Lima, Mary	Engle Progeny	2017	Hillsborough Co.	2015-7140	\$3,000,000	\$12,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$1,800,000 (as to RJR)
Gentile, Michael	Individual	2017	Palm Beach Co.	50:2015-5405	\$7,123,085	Not asserted	No reduction

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Olson, Michael	Engle Progeny	2018	Duval Co.	16-2008-396	\$5,000,000	\$2,500,000	No reduction
Rozar, Myra	Engle Progeny	2018	Duval Co.	16-2017-4311	\$375,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$96,612, including a stipulated additur as past non-economic damages
Capone, Karen	Individual	2018	Miami-Dade Co.	2005-10312	\$250,000	Not asserted	No reduction
Danielson, Micah	Engle Progeny	2018	Escambia Co.	2007-2737	\$250,000	Not applicable	Compensatory increased to \$2,576,543 due to additur
Simon, Marc	Engle Progeny	2018	Broward Co.	2007-27976	\$1,000,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$650,000
Bush, Charles	Engle Progeny	2018	Escambia Co.	2007-3083	\$3,525,000	\$1,095,000	Compensatory reduced to \$2,291,250
Marotta, Phil	Engle Progeny	2018	Broward Co.	2007-36723	Not applicable	\$300,000	No reduction
Harewood, Hanifah	Engle Progeny	2018	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-46331	\$6,500,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$1,670,845
Schlefstein, Leslie	Engle Progeny	2018	Broward Co.	2008-22558	\$13,965,000	\$27,999,999.99	Compensatory reduced to \$13,964,098
Landi, Herbert	Engle Progeny	2018	Broward Co.	2008-25814	\$8,000,000	\$12,000,000	No reduction

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Kaplan, Myron	Engle Progeny	2018	Broward Co.	2008-25823	\$2,107,212	\$2,971,000	No reduction
Boulter, Cynthia	Engle Progeny	2018	Lee Co.	2008-627	\$750,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$225,000
Burgess, Jacqueline	Engle Progeny	2018	St. Lucie	2009-6060	\$3,000,000	Defense	No reduction
Chadwell, Brenda	Engle Progeny	2018	Miami-Dade Co.	2010-17931	\$2,400,000	\$0	No reduction
Theis, Faye	Engle Progeny	2018	Sarasota Co.	2011-1941	\$7,000,000	\$14,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$6,918,270
Gloger, Kenneth	Engle Progeny	2018	Miami-Dade Co.	2011-23377	\$7,500,000	\$10,000,000	No reduction
Bessent-Dixon, Frances	Engle Progeny	2018	Alachua Co.	2015-2554	\$2,000,000	Mistrial	No reduction
Freeman, Jo	Engle Progeny	2018	Alachua Co.	2015-3930	\$4,000,000	\$0	No reduction
Graffeo, Rosemarie	Engle Progeny	2018	Pasco Co.	2016-233	\$4,500,000	\$15,000,000	No reduction
Rouse, Paul	Engle Progeny	2018	Miami-Dade Co.	2017-17202	\$5,000,000	\$2,250,000	No reduction
Brown, Margaret	Engle Progeny	2018	Volusia Co.	2017-30003	\$5,000,000	\$8,500,000	Compensatory reduced to \$3,250,000
Perrotto, Debra	Engle Progeny	2018	Palm Beach Co.	50:2007-23841	Not applicable	\$500,000 (RJR; defense as to PM USA)	No reduction
Coates, Brinda	Individual	2019	Orange Co.	1997-4541	\$300,000	\$16,000,000	Compensatory reduced to \$150,000

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Alvarez del Real, Jorge	Engle Progeny	2019	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-32909	\$1,200,000	\$150,000	No reduction
Zingaro, Karla	Engle Progeny	2019	Broward Co.	2007-36438	\$1,637,848	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$262,056 as to PM USA
Rintoul, Bryan	Engle Progeny	2019	Broward Co.	2007-36719	\$9,200,000	\$148,245,581	Compensatory reduced to \$9,027,079
Mahfuz, Richard	Engle Progeny	2019	Broward Co.	2007-36743	\$12,005,500	\$25,000,000	No reduction
Neff, Deborah	Engle Progeny	2019	Broward Co.	2007-36745	\$4,006,867	\$6,000,000	No reduction
McCall, Bernice	Engle Progeny	2019	Broward Co.	2007-36888	Not applicable	\$800,000	No reduction
Hamilton, Robert	Engle Progeny	2019	Broward Co.	2008-19632	\$6,000,000	\$4,600,000	No reduction
Moore, Robert	Engle Progeny	2019	Miami-Dade Co.	2008-858	\$0	\$1,000,000	No reduction
Jones, Janice	Engle Progeny	2019	Hillsborough Co.	2008-9036	\$500,000	\$3,250,000	Compensatory reduced to \$200,000
Gloger, Kenneth	Engle Progeny	2019	Miami-Dade Co.	2011-23377	\$15,000,000	\$27,500,000	No reduction
Harris, Margaret	Engle Progeny	2019	Gadsden Co.	2014-337	\$4,000,000	\$6,000,000	No reduction
Bessent-Dixon, Frances	Engle Progeny	2019	Alachua Co.	2015-2554	Not applicable	\$13,500,000	No reduction

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Russ, Lue	Engle Progeny	2019	Gadsden Co.	2015-42	\$400,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$100,000
Kelley, Daniel	Engle Progeny	2019	Pasco Co.	2017-2490	\$2,000,000	Agreement	No reduction
Holliman, Ruby	Engle Progeny	2019	Miami-Dade Co.	2017-2638	\$2,500,000	\$0	No reduction
Gafney, Kathleen	Engle Progeny	2019	Palm Beach Co.	50:2007-20540	\$1,000,000	Defense	No reduction
Frogel, Shan	Engle Progeny	2019	Palm Beach Co.	50:2007-23246	\$50,000	Not asserted	Compensatory reduced to \$25,000
Cuddihee, Sabrina	Engle Progeny	2020	Duval Co.	16-2008-398	\$2,500,000	\$0	No reduction
Snyder, Diane	Engle Progeny	2020	Broward Co.	2008-19467	\$12,500,000	Defense	No reduction
Duignan, Kevin	Engle Progeny	2020	Pinellas Co.	2013-10978	\$2,750,000	\$24,000,000	No reduction
Principe, Edward	Individual	2020	Miami-Dade Co.	2017-25772	\$10,560,000	Not permitted	No reduction
Wydra, Kathleen	Engle Progeny	2021	Duval Co.	16-2008-403	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000	Final judgment not entered
Yount, Lois	Engle Progeny	2021	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-30346	\$5,700,000	Defense	Compensatory reduced to \$2,673,300
Garcia, Odaima	Engle Progeny	2021	Miami-Dade Co.	2007-45267	\$5,510,000	Mistrial	Final judgment not entered
Ledo, Mirtha	Engle Progeny	2021	Miami-Dade Co.	2008-113	Not applicable	\$2,000,000	Final judgment not entered

<b>Plaintiff</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Court</b>	<b>Case No.</b>	<b>Actual damages awarded:</b>	<b>Punitive damages awarded:</b>	<b>Other</b>
Morse, Pearl	Engle Progeny	2021	Brevard Co.	2008-6848	\$5,000,000	Not permitted	Final judgment not entered
Leidinger, Rebecca	Engle Progeny	2021	Polk Co.	2010-3731	\$3,000,000	\$2,570,593	Final judgment not entered
Lipp, Michael	Engle Progeny	2021	Miami-Dade Co.	2017-18509	\$15,000,000	\$28,000,000	No reduction
Gordon, Roosevelt	Individual	2021	Gadsden Co.	2019-1074	\$2,969,880	Not permitted	No reduction
Spurlock, Judith	Engle Progeny	2021	Palm Beach Co.	50:2007-23631	\$540,915	\$2,000,000	Final judgment not entered

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on January 10, 2022, this appendix was electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the Florida Courts E-Portal Filing System, which will send a notice of electronic filing to counsel for the parties.

William H. Ogle  
Parama K. Liberman  
OGLE LAW FIRM  
444 Seabreeze Blvd., Suite 800  
Daytona Beach, FL 32118  
oglelaw@gmail.com  
PKLiberman@gmail.com  
miranda@oglelawfirm.com  
meri@oglelawfirm.com

Andrew B. Greenlee  
ANDREW B. GREENLEE, P.A.  
401 East 1st Street, Unit 261  
Sanford, FL 32772  
andrew@andrewgreenleelaw.com  
andrewbgreenlee@gmail.com

Joshua R. Gale Esq.  
WIGGINS CHILDS PANTAZIS  
FISHER & GOLDFARB LLC  
101 North Woodland Blvd.,  
Suite 600  
Deland, FL 32720  
jgale@wigginschilds.com  
ttodd@wigginschilds.com

Troy A. Fuhrman, Esq.  
Marie A. Borland, Esq.  
HILL WARD HENDERSON  
101 East Kennedy Boulevard,  
Suite 3700  
Tampa, FL 33601  
troy.fuhrman@hwlaw.com  
marie.borland@hwlaw.com

Charles R.A. Morse, Esq.  
JONES DAY  
250 Vesey Street  
New York, NY 10281-1047  
cramorse@jonesday.com

Jason T. Burnette, Esq.  
JONES DAY  
1420 Peachtree Street, N.E.,  
Suite 800  
Atlanta, GA 30309-3053  
jtburnette@jonesday.com

*Attorneys for Respondent*

*(cont'd on next page)*

John S. Mills  
BISHOP & MILLS, PLLC  
1 Independent Drive, Suite 1700  
Jacksonville, FL 32202  
jmills@bishopmills.com

Courtney Brewer  
Jonathan A. Martin  
Bailey Howard  
BISHOP & MILLS, PLLC  
325 North Calhoun Street  
Tallahassee, Florida 32301  
cbrewer@bishopmills.com  
jmartin@bishopmills.com  
bhoward@bishopmills.com  
service@bishopmills.com

*Attorneys for Petitioner*

s/ Geoffrey J. Michael  

---

Geoffrey J. Michael  
*Attorney for Amicus Curiae*  
*Philip Morris USA Inc.*